#### **Deep coalescence and ILS**

# Multispecies coalescent



## Shallow coalescence



#### Deep coalescence





#### Deep coalescence





"...species tree[s] are not the result of a consensus process - but of a 'reverse auction' - where the lowest bidder sets the limit." -- Heled and Drummond, 2010 (MBE 27:577)

## \*BEAST multispecies coalescent



### \*BEAST multispecies coalescent



Heled and Drummond (2010)

# \*BEAST vs concatenation

Heled and Drummond (2010) compared their (\*BEAST) method with concatenation, which fails when there is a lot of deep coalescence.

| From Table 2  | Topology<br>inside<br>95% | Topology<br>95% size | Speciation<br>time inside<br>95% | Speciation<br>time 95% size |
|---------------|---------------------------|----------------------|----------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| *BEAST        | 97                        | 1.8                  | 96                               | 1.5                         |
| Concatenation | 9                         | 1.4                  | 0.7                              | 5.3                         |
|               |                           |                      | 9                                |                             |

## The anomaly zone



Anything can happen now!

The Anomaly Zone

only one way for the gene tree to match this asymmetric species tree...

С

B







## The Anomaly Zone





1 way to get gene tree that matches species tree

2 ways to get symmetric gene tree that does not match species tree

Anomalous gene trees (AGTs) are gene trees that are more probable than the species tree

Degnan and Rosenberg (2006)

### Quartet-based species tree methods

# ASTRAL

For 4 taxa, anomalous gene trees only exist if *rooted* trees are considered...





weight (w) = number of gene trees in which quartet is found





## ASTRAL



34



# **SVDQuartets**

Quartet method that consults the original sequences rather than depending on gene trees being correctly estimated

taxon1 AAAGATTACAGGTTGACTTATTACACCCCGGAG... taxon2 AAAGATTATCGACTGACTTATTACACCCCCGAA... taxon3 AAAGATTACAGATTAACTTATTATACTCCTGAA... taxon4 AAAGATTATAAATTGACTTACTACACCCCGGAG...

AA AC AG AT CA  $p_{AAAC}$  $p_{AAAG}$  $p_{AAAT}$  $p_{AACA}$ The flat matrix for  $p_{AAAA}$ AA PACAA  $p_{ACAT}$ AC  $p_{ACAC}$  $p_{ACAG}$  $p_{ACCA}$ any quartet tree  $flat_{12|34} =$  $p_{AGAG}$  $p_{AGAT}$  $p_{AGCA}$ stores counts of sites AG  $p_{AGAA}$  $p_{AGAC}$ AT  $p_{ATAC}$  $p_{ATAG}$  $p_{ATAT}$  $p_{ATCA}$ • • •  $p_{ATAA}$ with patterns that CA  $p_{CAAA}$   $p_{CAAC}$  $p_{CACA}$  $p_{CAAG}$  $p_{CAAT}$ match the guartet tree

#### Chifman and Kubatko (2014)



# **SVDQuartets**

Symmetries among columns in the flat matrix are expected, even if there is ILS

For example p<sub>AAAC</sub> should approximately equal p<sub>AACA</sub> (and the same is true for every pair in these two columns)

|                         |    | AA         | AC         | AG         | AT         | CA         |                    |
|-------------------------|----|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|--------------------|
| flat <sub>12 34</sub> = | AA | $p_{AAAA}$ | $p_{AAAC}$ | $p_{AAAG}$ | $p_{AAAT}$ | $p_{AACA}$ | $  \cdots \rangle$ |
|                         | AC | $p_{ACAA}$ | $p_{ACAC}$ | $p_{ACAG}$ | $p_{ACAT}$ | $p_{ACCA}$ | • • •              |
|                         | AG | $p_{AGAA}$ | $p_{AGAC}$ | $p_{AGAG}$ | $p_{AGAT}$ | $p_{AGCA}$ | •••                |
|                         | AT | $p_{ATAA}$ | $p_{ATAC}$ | $p_{ATAG}$ | $p_{ATAT}$ | $p_{ATCA}$ | •••                |
|                         | CA | $p_{CAAA}$ | $p_{CAAC}$ | $p_{CAAG}$ | $p_{CAAT}$ | $p_{CACA}$ | •••                |
|                         |    |            | •          |            | •          | •          | ·,                 |
|                         |    | \ ·        |            | , .        | ·          |            | /                  |

Such symmetries reduce the **rank** of the flat matrix, which is a measure of how many columns (rows) are independent

(see PAUP\* command svdquartets)

# **SVDQuartets**

- Flat matrix should have rank
  - 16 for quartets **not** in the species tree
  - ≤10 for quartets that are in the species tree under coalescent model
  - ≤4 for quartets that are in the true tree if true tree is common to all sites
- Evaluate all quartets (or a sample)
- Construct tree from quartets that have rank  $\leq 10$
- To use version recently added to PAUP\*:
  - load concatenated data matrix
  - use svdquartets command